

## Effects of Child Maltreatment: A Case Study from Pakistan

Zahra Shaheen Premani, Catco Kids

MSc in International Primary Health Care, Advance Diploma in ECD, IBCLC, BScN, RN.

### Article Info

**Received:** June 23, 2021

**Accepted:** June 30, 2021

**Published:** July 05, 2021

**\*Corresponding author:** C: Zahra Shaheen Premani, MSc in International Primary Health Care, Advance Diploma in ECD, IBCLC, BScN, RN.

**Citation:** Zahra Shaheen Premani, Catco Kids. "Effects of Child Maltreatment: A Case Study from Pakistan", *J Pediatrics and Child Health Issues*, 2(5); DOI: <http://doi.org/03.2021/1.1027>.

**Copyright:** © 2021 Zahra Shaheen Premani. This is an open access article distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly Cited.

### Introduction

"My son, when he was one year old, I had to go to work to make my ends meet. So I had to send him to a nearby childcare center in our neighborhood. Gradually, he started crying when I reached the childcare center gate. I thought that [young] children do this. And I also could not leave my job so I kept on sending him to the center. Then one day, I received a call from the daycare that my son was injured. When I went to the center, he was bleeding from his head. I took him immediately to the hospital and he got stitches. When I inquired about this later, I came to know [about] some horror stories. The supervisor used to lock the children in dark room, make them stand in cold water in the winter and hit them on head with a comb. This is what she did with my son that day. I took him out of the center and even now, whenever I even pass that lane, my child refuses to go with me. My child is now 8 years old."

This is a very unfortunate but real situation for countless young children. The above situation occurred with a male child in one of the childcare centers in Karachi, Pakistan. As identified by WHO, numerous children suffer child abuse or maltreatment in their lives all over the world (Hyder & Malik, 2007). Children in Pakistan also suffer harsh physical maltreatment such as severe beating, shaking, burns, fractures attempted suffocation or strangulation or drug abuse (Mehnaz, 2018) by their parents, teachers or relatives for disciplinary purposes. Sometimes, the physical injuries are devastating, causing the children to run away from home (Malik, 2010). Being a part of cultural norm, child battery is perceived as a means to discipline children. As a result, teachers and caregivers are also given permission to use battery in schools and childcare centers by many parents.

Physical maltreatment is under reported in Pakistan (Zafar, Naeem, Zehra & Khalid, 2020). Approximately 50,000 children experiencing physical injuries are not reported (Malik, 2010). Thus, no reports with regards to children's physical maltreatment are available in Pakistan. A systematic review on violence against children in Pakistan revealed that only 15 published papers; three editorials, 10 original research papers, and two review papers, were found between 1984 and 2003, while 11 unpublished data was found in organizational reports were available from 1998 to 2003. The type of child maltreatment in these studies was not physical violence, rather child labor; sexual abuse; and child neglect (Hyder & Malik, 2007).

Childcare centers are relatively a new concept in Pakistan, and very few private and Government-run childcare centers exist in urban and semi urban areas (Zahidi, 2019), while none are found in rural areas (Khan, 2018). In many countries, childcare centers are regulated and licensed (NACCRRA, 2010), yet, in Pakistan, there is no accreditation body that regulates the childcare centers or any regulation for ongoing training of caregivers. Compounding the situation further, children are exposed to major safety issues that pose a serious risk to their life long physical and mental health.

Children who utilize childcare centers spend most of their early years at these facilities. The quality of care that they receive during these years impacts the personality of the child as a whole (Jamieson, Bertrand & Ibrahim, 2005; Masee & Barnett, n.d., Canadian Council on Learning, 2011). A study done by Crowley, Jeon and Rosethal (2013), that analyzed 676 routine, unannounced audit reports conducted by the Connecticut Department of Public Health licensing over a 2-year period, also concluded the same. Donoghue and Council on Early Childhood (August 2017) reiterated that there is a positive health outcome on children when there is consistent



developmentally appropriate and emotionally supportive care while poor quality can lead to unmet socioemotional needs of children, less preparedness for schools and increased school dropouts, lower cognitive and social skills (Crowley, Jeon, Rosenthal, Oct 2013; Donoghue and Council on Early Childhood, 2017, National Institute of Child Health and Human Development NICHD, 1997; Schpancer, 2017, Sylva, Stein, & Leach, 2010; Huntsman, 2008; Weaven & Grace, 2010; Schpancer, 2017; Espey, 2003; Workman & Ullrich, Feb 2017; Etse, 2004).

## Literature Review

Child maltreatment, or child abuse, has many definitions. The Child Abuse Prevention and Treatment Act (CAPTA) defines child maltreatment as: "Any recent act or failure to act on the part of a parent or caretaker, which results in death, serious physical or emotional harm, sexual abuse, or exploitation, or an act or failure to act which presents an imminent risk of serious harm." (Font and Maguire-Jack, 2021).

Child maltreatment in the early years leaves a negative imprint on the child's brain. Regardless of age, socio economic background, religion and culture, millions of children worldwide experience child maltreatment every day (Chitiyo & Pietrtoni, 2019). World Health Organization (WHO) estimates that approximately 3 in 4 children or 300 million children aged 2 to 4 years, experience physical maltreatment by parents or caregivers (2020). Child maltreatment or child abuse exists in many types, such as physical, emotional, sexual and neglect. Out of them, available research shows that emotional abuse is the most common form of abuse, physical abuse is the most reported form of abuse while sexual is the least reported one (Foster, Olson-Dorff, Reiland, & Budzak-Garza, 2017).

Young children are most vulnerable to child abuse, merely because of their dependency on their caregivers (Fang et al, 2012). Data from HHS (2017) revealed that children under three are more prone to child abuse, with boys more vulnerable to physical abuse and girls to sexual abuse (Chitiyo & Pietrtoni, 2019). Approximately 80% of children experience physical abuse by their parents, primary caregivers (Crosson-Tower, 2003), family members, teachers, health care workers, employers and acquaintances (Zafar, Naeem, Zehra & Khalid, 2020). Various factors lead to child maltreatment, such as parental stress, parental health, parental drug use, and parental belief in corporal punishment.

Child maltreatment has been found to be under reported, particularly if the school personnel lack training to identify and report such cases (Altafim & Linhares, 2016). A study done by Usakli in 2012, revealed that though the teachers and school counselors were aware of the effects of child maltreatment, yet they reported being unprepared to tackle child maltreatment at school, including identification of the issue, reporting and resolution.

The effects of maltreatment on children are detrimental. Children who undergo child maltreatment have poor developmental outcomes, affecting their physical, psychological, emotional and academic performances later in life. Unfortunately, children are unable to discuss their experiences and feelings with anybody, due to perpetrators being their parents and caregivers. As a result, they

do not receive the required support and care and feel devastated emotionally and psychologically.

Besides having fractured bones, bruises and pain all over body, young children experiencing physical abuse eventually have difficulty coping emotionally with the situation. The most critical development in the early years is healthy emotional development. Yet, children who are maltreated early cannot differentiate between emotions such as sadness and anger. If this continues, the child may develop a condition called alexithymia, which is the inability to "read emotions", consequently, lacking the ability to recognize own and other's emotional responses (Stirling and Jackson 2008). Since children are unable to verbalize their feelings, they may undergo anxiety, depression (Zafar, Naeem, Zehra & Khalid, 2020), feelings of social isolation, lower self-esteem (Nyarko, Addai & Amissah & Dedzo, 2014) and Post Traumatic Stress Disorders (PTSD), leading to suicide, difficulty sleeping, oppositional behaviors, attachment and trust issues, violent behaviors (Stirling and Jackson, 2008), alcohol, cigarette or drug abuse later in life (Chitiyo & Pietrtoni, 2019). A prospective cohort design study by Chauhan and Wisdom (2012) was conducted in the mid-Western area of USA, consisting total 1575 individuals as case and controls with a documented history of child abuse and neglect from court documents. The individuals were interviewed at age 29 years from 1989 to 1995, at age 40 years from 2000 to 2002 and again at age 41 years from 2003 to 2005. The study found that individuals who were maltreated as children were found to be living in neighborhoods with more disadvantage, social isolation and drug use, as compared to the control group. Another systematic review of 124 studies conducted by Norman et al (2012) also revealed an association of physical maltreatment of children with negative health outcomes such as mental disorders, drug use, suicide attempts, Sexually Transmitted Infections (STI's) and unsafe sexual behaviors. Stirling and Jackson (2008) further reiterate that early maltreatment alters physiological response to stressful stimuli, consequently altering the child's socialization. Additionally, it also affects children's physical health in later life, making them prone to diabetes, hypertension, stroke and Cancer.

Children experiencing maltreatment also face negative consequences in their academic performance with lower academic, language and cognitive performance (Romano, Babchishin, Marquis, Frchette, 2015; Stirling and Jackson, 2008), lower levels of school preparedness and behavioral problems like aggression and tantrums (Chitiyo & Pietrtoni, 2019). Multiple studies suggest that children experiencing maltreatment had poor performance in exams lower GPA, and problems with completing homework assignments due to attention deficit (Almuneef & Altamimi, 2015; Slade and Wissow, 2007; Romano, Babchishin, Marquis, Frchette, 2015). Due to poor academic performance, there is an increase in school dropout rates, criminal activities, and inability to be economically efficient, resulting in dependency on welfare programs and homelessness.

Caregivers work with children in childcare centers, in the absence of their parents. Their relationship with the children is imperative for children to thrive. The children form secure attachments to their caregivers and may experience negative health outcomes due to lack of thereof. According to Bowlby's attachment theory, children biologically behave in ways that gain their caregiver's



attention and love. Caregiver response and touch foster security, positive emotions and attention of children, promoting a positive nurturing environment. Attachment involves hugging, cuddling and caressing, which promotes a child's secure internal working model. On the contrary, poor attachment forms such internal working model that interferes with relationships, leading to feelings of neglect, feelings of isolation, poor self-esteem and anxiety (Nyarko, Amisssah, Addai & Dedzo 2014). The supervisor of the center mentioned earlier physically and emotionally abused the child, which eventually posed him on physical and mental health risk. Due to her punitive behavior, the child experienced both physical and emotional trauma, which he could not erase from his memory for a long time.

### Key Learning for Practice

Child maltreatment is preventable. There are several strategies that can be used to decrease its prevalence in our society. Training of caregivers can be used as a tool to prevent child abuse in childcare centers to reduce the prevalence of maltreatment and early recognition of the issue. Yet, teachers working with children were found to be unaware of signs and symptoms of maltreatment (Usakli, 2012). Therefore, the schools and childcare centers should make it mandatory for all caregivers to receive ongoing training in this area. Additionally, schools and childcare centers should have a clear reporting policy for child maltreatment, which is well communicated to them. Most importantly, a quality assurance mechanism should be in place, especially in countries like Pakistan, where no monitoring and evaluation system for schools and childcare centers exist. Regular audits and inspections should be conducted, in order to identify and report such issues. A child who is maltreated may require professional help and therapy. Early identification by parents or childcare providers and referral to a child psychotherapist will help the child heal and be able to form secure relationships again. Training and support for parents and teachers also need to be established and the stress level at the school and childcare center environment should be kept at a minimum. Happy caregivers will be able to nurture happy children. Ensuring support groups for both teachers/caregivers and parents, professional counseling, ongoing training workshops, awareness programs can help the school and childcare center administrations achieve this goal.

### References

1. Aga Khan Foundation, Pakistan. (June 29, 2003). Early Childhood Care and Development in Pakistan: A Second Review. *Aga Khan Foundation, Pakistan*. 1-28
2. Almuneef, M, A. & Altamimi, D. (Jan 2015). The impact of child maltreatment on school performance in Saudi Arabia. *Hamdan Medical Journal*.
3. Altafim, E. R. P., & Linhares, M. B. M. (2016). Universal violence and child maltreatment prevention programs for parents: A systematic review. *Psychosocial Intervention*. 25(1), 27-38.
4. Arnold, C, Bartlett, K, Gowani, S, Merali, R. (2006). Is everybody ready? Readiness, transition and continuity: Lessons, reflections and way forward.
5. Arnold, C. (May 22<sup>nd</sup> 2001). Early Childhood Development programs and children's rights.
6. Boo, F.L., Araujo, M.C. & Tome, R. (February, 2016). How is childcare quality measured: A tool kit. *IDB*.
7. Canadian Council on Learning. (November 2006). Why is high-quality childcare essential? The link between quality childcare and early learning: Lessons in Learning. *Canadian Council on Learning*.
8. Bassok, D., Markowitz, A.J., Player, D., Zagardo, M. (March, 2018). Are parent's ratings and satisfaction with preschools related to program features? *University of Virginia*.
9. Chauhan, P. & Wisdom, C.P. (Aug 2012). Childhood maltreatment and illicit drug use in middle adulthood: The role of neighborhood characteristics. *Development and Psychology*. 24(3). 723-38.
10. Chitiyo, J., & Pietrantonio, Z. (2019). The impact of child maltreatment on the educational and psychological well-being of students. *Journal of School Counseling*. 17(18).
11. Crosson-Tower, C. (2003) The role of educators in preventing and responding to child abuse and neglect. Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services.
12. Crowley, A.A., Jeon, S., Rosenthal, M.S. (Oct 2013). Health and safety of childcare centers: An analysis of licensing specialists reports of routine, unannounced inspections. *American Journal of Public Health*. 103(10):e52-8.
13. Donoghue E, A. and Council on Early Childhood. (August 2017). Quality early education and childcare from birth to Kindergarten. *Pediatrics*. August 2017, 140 (2) e20171488;
14. Espey, J. (March 2003). Perceptions Of Quality Child Care: Final Report. *Espey & Good Company*.
15. Etse, S. (2004). Parents' and Other Caregivers' Perception of Early Childhood Development Needs and Quality: A Study of the PLAN-Assisted Program in Bawjiase, Ghana. University of Victoria.
16. Fang, X., Brown, D. S., Florence, C. S., & Mercy, J. A. (2012). The economic burden of child maltreatment in the United States and implications for prevention. *Child Abuse & Neglect*. 36(2), 156-165.
17. Font, S, A. & Maguire-Jack, K. (Jan 2021). The scope, nature and causes of child abuse and neglect. *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*.
18. Foster, R. H., Olson-Dorff, D., Reiland, H. M., & Budzak-Garza, A. (2017). Commitment, confidence, and concerns: Assessing health care professionals' child maltreatment reporting attitudes. *Child Abuse and Neglect*. 67, 54-63.
19. Goodfellow, J. (April 2004). Reframing Early Education: What Do Parents Value for Their Children? University of Western Sydney-Penrith.
20. Huntsman, L. (April 2008). Determinants of quality in childcare: A review of research evidence. *NSW Department of Community Services*.
21. Hyder, A.A. & Malik, F.A. (2007). Violence against children: A challenge for public health in Pakistan. *Journal of Health, Population and Nutrition*. 25(2): 168-178.
22. Jamieson, J., Bertrand, J, Ibrahim, E. (2005). The Science of Early Child Development. *Winnipeg: Red River College*.
23. Khan, M.N. (Oct 26, 2018). Working Pakistani mothers find solace in daycares but is society ready to accept it? *Dawn*.
24. Malik, F. (Oct 2010). Determinants of child abuse in Pakistani families: Parental acceptance-rejection and demographic variables. *International Journal of Business and Social Science*. Vol. 1 No. 1.



25. Mehnaz, A. (2018). Child abuse in Pakistan-Current perspective. *National Journal of Health Sciences*. 3, 114-117.
26. NACCRRRA. (Sept 2010). The economy's impact on parent's choices and perceptions about childcare. *National Association of Child Care Resource and Referral Agencies (NACCRRRA)*.
27. NICHD. (January 2006). The NICHD study of early childcare and youth development: Findings for children upto age 4 1/2 years. *US Department of Health and Human Services*.
28. Norman, E.R., Byambaa, M., De, R., Butchart, A., Scott, J., & Vos, T. (2012). The Long-Term Health Consequences of Child Physical Abuse, Emotional Abuse, and Neglect: A Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis. *PLoS Medicine*. 9 (11): e1001349.
29. Nyarko, K, Amissah, C.M, Addai, P & Dedzo, B.Q. (July 2014). The effect of child abuse on children's psychological health. *Psychology and Behavioral Sciences*. Vol. 3, No. 4, 2014, pp. 105-112.
30. Pearlmutter, S, Bartle, EE. (2004). Participant's perceptions of the childcare subsidy system. *Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare*.
31. Romano, E., Babchishin, L., Marquis, R., & Frchette, S. (2015). Childhood maltreatment and educational outcomes. *Trauma, Violence & Abuse*. 16 (4). 418-437.
32. Schpancer, N. (Oct 5, 2017). Non Parental daycare: What the research tells us. *Psychology Today*.
33. Shlay, AB, Tran, H, Weinraub, M, Harmon, M. (2005). Teasing apart the childcare conundrum: A factorial survey analysis of childcare quality, fair market price and willingness to pay low-income, African-American parents. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*. 20, 383-406.
34. Slade, E.P., & Wissow, L.S. (Oct 2007). The impact of childhood maltreatment on adolescent's academic performance. *Economics of Education Review*. 26(5). 604-614.
35. Stirling, J., & Jackson, L.A. (2008). Understanding the behavioral and emotional consequences of child abuse. *American Academy of Pediatrics*.
36. Sylva, A, Stein, A, Leach, P. (2010). A prospective study of the effects of different kinds of care on children's development in the first five years. *Families Children and Child Care Project*.
37. Torquati, J, Raikes, HH, Huddleton-Casas, CA, Bovaird, JA, Harris, BA. (2001). Family income, parent education and perceived constraints as predictors of observed program quality and parent rated program quality. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*. (26), 443-464.
38. Usakli, H. (2012). School help professionals' ideas on child abuse and neglect. *Journal of Educational Sciences and Psychology*. 54(2), 115-124.
39. Weaven, S, Grace, D. (June 2010). Examining parental and staff perceptions of childcare services quality across competing business structures. *Australasian Journal of Early Childhood*. 35 (2).
40. World Health Organization (8 June, 2020). Child Maltreatment.
41. Workman, S & Ullrich, R. (February 13, 2017). Quality 101: Identifying the core components of a High-Quality Early Childhood Programs. *Centre for American Progress*.
42. Zafar, N, Naem, M, Zehra, A. & Khalid, M. (Jan-Mar 2020). Ten years data of child abuse and neglect cases managed at the first hospital based Child Protection Unit in Pakistan. *Asia Pacific Journal of Pediatrics and Child Health*. Vol 3.
43. Zahidi, F. (March 24, 2019). Not enough daycare facilities. *The News on Sunday (TNS)*.